

## EUROPEAN FORUM FOR NATIONAL AEROSPACE NDT BOARDS

The 6th meeting of the Forum for NANDTB was held at DGZfP, Max-Planck-Str. 6, 12489 Berlin, Germany, on 23<sup>rd</sup> June 2009 at 09:00

### CONFIRMED MINUTES

- 1) 09:00 - Opening of the meeting
  - a) Those in attendance were welcomed by Ralf Holstein, a member of the German NANDTB, on behalf of the DGZfP.
- 2) The Chairman asked each person present to introduce themselves and state their affiliation.
- 3) The list of those in attendance, and a record of apologies for absence received, was read out and is recorded at Annex B to these minutes.
- 4) Vice Chairmanship
  - a) The German NANDTB informed the Forum that the present ANDTBF vice chairman, Manfred Podlech, was no longer a member of the German Board and, as for this reason, the Forum agreed that the election of a new vice chairman was necessary.
  - b) Mr. Rudolf HENRICH was proposed, seconded and unanimously supported for appointment as the Vice Chairman with immediate effect. The Secretary was asked to formalise the appointment for a term of office of two years. **Action 2009/01: Secretary**
- 5) The agenda and matters for discussion under 'Any Other Business' were agreed.
- 6) Minutes of the previous meeting
  - a) The minutes of the 5<sup>th</sup> Forum were accepted as an accurate record of the meeting, and the Secretary was asked to upload them to the Forum website as confirmed minutes of the meeting.
  - b) Matters arising (not covered by the agenda) were limited to a review of progress on actions assigned at the last Forum:

Reference	Action agreed	Assignment and timescale	Remarks
2008/01	Set up a WG comprising representatives of Italy, France, Switzerland and Germany, under the governorship of Manfred Podlech, who would define the scope of the work, including timelines for completion of various phases, a report of which would be presented to the next meeting together with a completed draft syllabus covering aerospace Product	Manfred Podlech; 2009-06-01	Due to the situation recorded under item 4a above, this assignment had not been progressed. New WG members R Henrich, P Auge, R Klieber were assigned, and in the absence of a volunteer to lead the WG, the Secretary agreed to coordinate WG activity through circulation and registration of documents.

Reference	Action agreed	Assignment and timescale	Remarks
	Technology.		
2008/02	It was proposed to encourage members to provide links from their own to the Forum's web pages. Mr. Holstein volunteered to co-ordinate the provision of two-way links to improve information flow.	Ralf Holstein; 2009-06-01	Responses of Forum members to this action had been disappointingly few. Less than 50% of members had established websites.
2008/03	Through judicious use of search engines such as Google, the profiles of the Forum and its members should be raised, and Mr. Holstein undertook to discuss this with Mr. Stefan Cullmann of the DGZFP, and to report back to the next meeting with proposals.	Ralf Holstein and John Thompson; 2009-06-01	Mr. Holstein had prepared in anticipation of input from members but, although Mr. Thompson had requested the assistance of the membership at large in the generation of general interest material for publication in journals and on websites, the response had been disappointing.
2008/04	Mr. Thompson to incorporate the above actions into an updated Forum action plan.	John Thompson; 2008-12-31	Completed.

7) A vision for the future of the Forum

- a) The Chairman gave a short presentation, outlining his vision for the future of the Forum, which had been distributed to all members prior to the meeting.
- b) The primary goal was, he said, to achieve global harmonization for aerospace NDT qualification and certification through controls exerted by national aerospace NDT boards. This would include working closely with the regulator (EASA) to make the rules relevant and appropriate. There would be a need to set up a framework to deal with regional variations in regulations, and to promote best practice in NDT for both maintenance and manufacturing sectors.
- c) The Chairman reminded all attendees that implementation of the agreed mechanism to harmonise the operations of members was a condition for continued membership of the Forum. It would be necessary, he said, to establish that each of the Forum members was implementing ANDTBF/05 (Harmonisation of the Operations of the Members of the Forum), which was approved at the 3<sup>rd</sup> December 2008 Forum in Fuerth, Germany, and members were to be formally requested to confirm that this was the case. **Action 2009/02: members** to inform the Secretary that ANDTBF/05 was implemented in their country.
- d) The Chairman emphasized that the meetings of the Forum, which were held at approximately six monthly intervals, could not be working meetings – there was simply insufficient time available at such meetings to produce and agree output. The meetings provided only the opportunity to report on the progress made by working groups between Forum meetings, and to approve output distributed in advance, define new goals, and assign responsibility for actions within set timescales. It was vital, he reminded all present, that good progress was made between meetings.
- e) There was a short discussion regarding the 'recognition' of NANDTB and the Forum by National Airworthiness Authorities (NAA) and EASA. It was pointed out that the majority of Boards are only informally recognised by NAA, and that EASA has not

- f) It was agreed to publish the Chairman's 'Vision' presentation file on the Forum website. **Action 2009/03: Secretary.**

8) Action plan

- a) The Secretary presented a review of progress on actions completed.

i) Clarification on EASA regulations. The action had been completed, but it was reported that EASA Part 145 would be revised or replaced by a new rule in 2010 (May or June). See Annex C.

ii) Communications with Nadcap. Completed. The Chairman reported that NADCAP was already deferring to NANDTB for the control of qualification examinations for NDT personnel under EASA part 21. He was asked to forward to EASA a copy of the NADCAP audit checklist. **Action 2009/04: Chairman.**

iii) Harmonisation of operations of Forum members. Completed with the publication of ANDTBF/05. Mr. Henrich commented that, since NADCAP required implementation of EN 4179 for part 21, and EASA required the same standard to be implemented for part 145, the requirements for NDT personnel qualification and certification were already harmonised.

(1) Messrs. Auge and Henrich both indicated that some suppliers to the aerospace industry had to satisfy both EN 473 and EN 4179. The Chairman indicated that the PCN Scheme in the UK provided simultaneous compliance with the qualification and certification requirements of EN 473 and the qualification requirements of EN 4179 (leaving the employer to comply with the certification requirements of the latter).

(2) At this point, there was a discussion about the e-qualified scheme introduced by PRI. In answer to the question "is this in accordance with EN 4179?", the Chairman thought that it was. PRI had planned to initiate the scheme in Toulouse, France, in January 2010 but, after a request from COSAC, they had agreed to desist. M. Bernardi stated that he had heard that PRI were to introduce this e-qualified scheme in the UK.

(3) Sergio Nascimento presented a PowerPoint summary of responses to a survey that he had initiated in order to gather information concerning the nature of operations of each of the Boards. The survey had not elicited a comprehensive response from members, and it was agreed that the Secretary would request those members that had not yet responded to do so within a defined period. **Action 2009/05: Secretary**

iv) Interpretation of standards for qualification and certification of aerospace NDT personnel. Ongoing.

v) Organise a workshop to discuss the work of the Forum. Completed at the 5<sup>th</sup> Forum.

vi) Organise a session at ECNDT 2010. This action remains 'in progress', but it has already been confirmed that meetings facilities are to be made available on 11<sup>th</sup> June 2010 from 10:00 to 12:30 just before the closing ceremony of the 10<sup>th</sup> European Conference on NDT in Moscow. It should be noted that, since the time

- b) New actions agreed at the 6<sup>th</sup> Forum
- i) Develop training syllabuses for aerospace NDT, including product technology. There were no volunteers to chair a task group or to participate in this work, so the Secretary agreed to take initial action. **Action 2009/06: Secretary.** Members would be asked to participate, and a volunteer to convene the task group would be sought.
  - ii) Elevate the profile of the Forum and its member boards by submission of reports and articles for publication on the Forum's website. **Action 2009/07: All members.**
  - iii) Update and circulate revised action plan. **Action 2009/08: Secretary**
- 9) Member's issues (for discussion/resolution)
- a) Alitalia (Italy) had provided a presentation and paper which had been circulated to members prior to the meeting, and which was presented by Mr. Giancarlo Spera on behalf of the Italian Board. This showed that, in Italy, the NAA required NDT personnel to hold not only EN 4179 certification, but also a licence if they were required to certify an inspection (and sign the Certificate of Release to Service). There was extensive discussion of this issue, and it was confirmed by Mr. Minas Fytos that possession of EN 4179 was not sufficient for authority to certify a Form 1, the NDT operator also had to possess a national license. Mr. Albert Muscat stated that an employee of a D1 rated laboratory cannot sign the CRS; the signatory had to be an employee of a B1 or B2 rated organisation. At the conclusion of the discussion, Mr Colin Langley agreed to take this up with the EASA person responsible and to communicate with Ms. Tajes who would provide an answer to be annexed to these minutes. **Action 2009/09: Colin Langley and Rosa Tajes.**
  - b) Colin Hockings (Australia), though not present at this meeting, had submitted a paper requesting interpretation of clause 4 of EASA AMC 145.A30(f) Personnel requirements "*.....In the absence of a national aerospace NDT board, the NDT board of another Member State should be used, as defined by the competent authority.*" Ms. Tajes stated that, since EASA has no powers to recognise NANDTB – or even this Forum – EASA cannot deal with this question. It was agreed to survey members on whether (and how) NAAs had accepted that foreign NANDTB could provide cover in their or other areas of influence. It was agreed by the meeting that further discussion on this would be deferred to the next meeting, by which time the results of a survey in answer to the question, and a discussion paper with responses would be circulated. **Action 2009/10: Secretary.**
  - c) The Swiss Board presented papers on gaining experience simultaneously for certification in multiple NDT methods, qualification (a flowchart) and equivalent vision standards.
    - i) Following extensive discussion, some members present considered that the proposal for gaining experience simultaneously for certification in multiple NDT methods was not in the spirit of the standard, but it was agreed that this proposal was to be referred by members to their national Boards, which were to be asked to respond, with or without comments or justification, on the acceptability of the proposal contained in the paper. **Action 2009/11: Members**
    - ii) The Swiss presentation, in flowchart form, on qualification was noted for information, and was to be circulated with these minutes. **Action 2009/12: Secretary.**

- iii) A third presentation by the Swiss Board related to alternative vision standards, and was received with a high degree of interest. It was discussed at some length and, though no conclusions were reached, it was agreed that it be circulated to all members for information and comment. **Action 2009/13: Secretary & Members.**

10) Confirm status of applicable regulations and standards

- a) AMC part 145. The present meeting was attended by three EASA representatives, and Ms. Rosa Tages has kindly provided a formal response concerning the status of AMC 145, as well as information concerning the rulemaking process. This is annexed to these minutes.
- b) prEN 4179:2008 and AIA NAS 410 : 2008. In response to a question on the status of prEN4179:2008, it was pointed out that, although the draft has not yet been approved by CEN via the 2 month ballot, it is already an 'industry standard', technically equivalent to AIA-NAS-410, and is widely implemented by part 145 and part 21 organisations. It was agreed that the Secretary would write to Ms. Tages asking that EASA consider formal recognition prEN 4179:2008 as an industry standard acceptable to EASA for implementation by ANDTB. **Action 2009/14: Secretary.**
- c) On a question raised regarding possible conflict of NAS-410 clause 4.5.1 with EASA AMC part 145, it was agreed after a short discussion that no such conflict existed.
- d) ANDTBF to provide an interpretation panel?
  - i) The Chairman gave a short presentation on past, present and future processes for handling requests for interpretation of AIA-NAS-410, which now also included EN 4179. There was a brief discussion, and the meeting agreed to the proposal of the Chairman, which was that he approach the AIA-NAS project group with a proposal to involve NANDTB and the Forum in the interpretation consultation process. **Action 2009/15: Chairman.**
  - ii) An Interpretation request was tabled and, pending the outcome of Action 2009/15, it was agreed to circulate this to members for information.

11) Review status of ANDTBF documents

- a) The meeting received and approved for publication the annual report of the Forum covering the 12 months to 31<sup>st</sup> December 2008. The Secretary to upload to the Forum web-page. **Action 2009/16: Secretary**
- b) The Secretary agreed to review and update ANDTBF/04 (PowerPoint presentation on the formation and work of the ANDTBF). **Action 2009/17: Secretary**

12) The ANDTBF web pages were maintained and regularly updated by the Secretary. Members had been requested to make contributions of general interest in order that the site remained interesting and 'live', but there had been little or no response. This requirement was considered to remain a standing **Action 2009/18: all members.**

13) Relevant conferences and seminars

- a) The ATA NDT Forum, USA, commencing 22<sup>nd</sup> September for four days.

14) Date and location for 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> meetings

- a) Provisionally, 14<sup>th</sup> October 2009, in Rome (Secretary's note: subsequently changed to Basel, 7<sup>th</sup> December 2009)
- b) June 2010, date to be decided
- c) The Forum recorded its gratitude to DGZfP for hosting the meeting (providing excellent facilities and catering).

**END**

## Annex A: Actions and assignments agreed at the 6<sup>th</sup> Forum

Reference	Action agreed	Assignment and timescale	Remarks
2009/01	Add R Henrich to ANDTBF/02 representing the German Board, and as Vice Chairman of the Forum until 22 June 2011	Sec	Completed 2009-10-15
2009/02	Establish that each of the Forum members is implementing ANDTBF/05 (Harmonisation of the Operations of the Members of the Forum).	All members (2009-09-21) Inform the Secretary whether ANDTBF/05 is implemented in their country.	See Annex A of ANDTBF/05 Rev A dated 2009-10-14
2009/03	publish Chairman's 'Vision' presentation file on Forum web-page	Secretary (2009-09-21)	To be completed following the Basel meeting
2009/04	Provide to Secretary for onward transmission to EASA a copy of the NADCAP audit checklist.	Chairman (2009-09-21)	Carried forward
2009/05	Gather information concerning the nature of operations of each of the Boards (continuation of the survey initiated by the Portuguese Board)	Secretary (2009-09-21)	Survey request 2009-10-15. Repeated 2009-10-23
2009/06	New action plan item: Develop training syllabuses for aerospace NDT, including product technology. Members would be asked to participate, and a volunteer to convene a task group would be sought.	Secretary and members (2009-09-21) for formation of task group and initiation of work.	Action plan updated 2009-10-15
2009/07	New action plan item: Elevate the profile of the Forum and its member boards through provision of information and short articles about the work of the Forum and its individual member's boards.	Members (2009-09-21)	Action plan updated 2009-10-15
2009/08	Update and circulate revised action plan.	Secretary (2009-09-21)	Action plan updated 2009-10-15
2009/09	Discuss within EASA the fact that possession of EN 4179 was not sufficient for authority to certify a Form 1, the NDT operator also has to possess a national license. Mr Colin Langley agreed to take this up with the EASA person responsible and to communicate with Ms. Tajés who would provide an answer for circulation to members.	Colin Langley and Rosa Tajes (2009-09-21)	Carried forward, with request for a flowchart showing what is required of the L3 providing outside agency services.
2009/10	Interpretation of clause 4 of EASA AMC 145.A30(f) Personnel requirements ".....In the absence of a national aerospace NDT board, the NDT board of another Member State should be used, as defined by the competent authority." Further discussion on this was deferred to the next meeting, by which time the results of a survey in answer to the question, and a discussion paper with responses would be circulated	Secretary (2009-09-21)	Survey initiated 2009-10-15. Repeated 2009-10-23
2009/11	A Swiss Board proposal for gaining experience simultaneously for certification in multiple NDT methods is to be referred by members to their national Boards, which were to be asked to respond, with or without comments or justification, on the acceptability of the proposal contained in the Swiss paper	Members (2009-09-21)	Carried forward
2009/12	Swiss presentation, in flowchart form, on qualification was noted for information, and was to be circulated with these minutes.	Secretary	2009-08-24 All to confirm the flowchart or provide alternatives for adoption by the Forum
2009/13	A presentation by the Swiss Board related to alternative vision standards is to be circulated to all members for information and comment	Secretary & Members	2009-08-24
2009/14	Request that EASA consider formal recognition of prEN 4179:2008 as an industry standard acceptable for implementation by ANDTB	Secretary & EASA Rulemaking	EASA response is that the prEN is not a standard.
2009/15	Propose to the AIA-NAS project group that the NANDTB Forum be consulted in the interpretation consultation process.	Chairman (2009-09-21)	Completed. JB to report at 2009-12-08

<b>Reference</b>	<b>Action agreed</b>	<b>Assignment and timescale</b>	<b>Remarks</b>
2009/16	Upload Annual report (to 31 December 2008) to the Forum web-page.	Secretary (2009-09-21)	2009 report to be completed following the Basel meeting
2009/17	Review and update ANDTBF/04 (PowerPoint presentation on the formation and work of the ANDTBF).	Secretary (2009-09-21)	2009-10-15
2009/18	Members are requested to make contributions of general interest to the Secretary for upload to the ANDTBF web pages in order that the site remained interesting and 'live'.	Members (2009-09-21 and ongoing)	

**Annex B: 2009-06-23\_ANDTBF Attendance**
**Status: 2009-06-23**

Representing	Representative(s) attending or offering apologies	Attending	Apologies
ANDTBF	THOMPSON John	1	0
Australia	HOCKINGS Colin	0	1
Austria	WOTTLE Roman	1	0
Belgium	Ante TOMASOVIC	0	1
Czech Republic	ZAVADIL Zbynek	1	0
Denmark	RASMUSSEN Henrik	1	0
EASA	TAJES Rosa, Karl Specht and Colin Langley	3	0
Finland	Marko YLITALO	0	1
FAA (Frankfurt)	Charles E. CUNNINGHAM	0	1
France	BERNADI, Joseph and AUGE, Patrick	2	0
Germany	HENRICH Rudolf and HOLSTEIN Ralf	2	0
Greece	Minas J. FYTOS	1	0
Hungary	Tamás STIFTER	1	0
Hungary	JUHASZ, Peter	0	1
Iran	YAKHSHI MJ and JALAL Javaheri Pour (observers)	2	0
Ireland	DOYLE John and McAULEY Mark	0	2
Italy	Giancarlo SPERA attending instead of Luigi MERLETTI	1	1
Luxembourg	CRAB Danny	0	1
Malta	MUSCAT, Albert	1	0
Netherlands	BUIJSEN Franc	0	1
Poland	Adam WOCIAL	1	0
Portugal	NASCIMENTO Sérgio	1	0
Russia	MIKOLAICHUK Uriy Alecsandrovich, BATOV Georgy Pavlovich, and DIOGENOVA Sergeya Vitalevicha	3	0
Spain	Fermín FRAILE and Pedro PERFUMO	0	2
Sweden	GRYBÄCK Thomas	1	0
Switzerland	KLIEBER René and LINDGENS Jürgen	2	0
Turkey	SUNAOĞLU İlker and TANRISEVER Ercan	2	0
UK	BIDDULPH Jon	1	0
	Total	28	12

## Annex C – questions to (and answers from) EASA Rulemaking

---

### Question:

In AMC 145.A.30 (f) when is the reference to EN4179:2000 going to be corrected to the latest standard?

### Answer:

The reference to the year-version will be removed in the development of task 145.001 (b) expected to be finished in 2<sup>nd</sup> quarter 2010. The publication of the outcome of this task will depend on the approval by the Commission of the consolidated pending opinions which are currently under discussion.

Additionally the Agency position is that the latest European Standard version of EN4179 can be used by the Member State, as the year-reference is made on the AMC and paragraph 145.A.30 (f) states “in accordance with the European or equivalent Standard recognized by the Agency”.

As for the use of prEN4179:2008, as far as I know this is still a draft standard, has it been ratified as European Standard or adopted by any National Standard Body?

---

### Foreign NDT boards

Rulemaking task 145.023 envisages modifying and adopting additional Acceptable Means of Compliance (AMC) to Part-145, in order to solve current shortcomings and inconsistencies when dealing with approval of non-EU organizations. One of the paragraphs that need to be revised is AMC 145.A.30 to clarify the concept of national NDT board in case of a non-EU organisation.

2009-2013 rulemaking programme is available on the Agency’s web site and it can be found [here](#).

This task is still on going, the Notice of Proposed Amendment (NPA) is expected to be published for external consultation before the end of 2009. The consultation period lasts 3 months and any interested person may comment to the NPA using the comment response tool ([EASA CRT](#)) developed by the Agency.

---

### Rulemaking process

As explained during the meeting, the Rulemaking process followed by the Agency is described in Agency Management Board Decision no. 8/2007. This document and the related procedures may be found [here](#).

During the rulemaking process the agency makes use of the inputs provided by two Consultative Bodies, the Advisory Group of National Authorities (AGNA) and the Safety Standards Consultative Committee (SSCC). Composition of these two bodies can be found on the Agency web site or in the following [link](#).

---

**Rosa Tages**

EASA Rulemaking

2009-06-30