

## EUROPEAN FORUM FOR NATIONAL AEROSPACE NDT BOARDS

**CONFIRMED** Minutes of the 7th meeting of the Forum for NANDTB, which was held at the Swissair building, Basel Airport, Switzerland, on Tuesday 8<sup>th</sup> December 2009.

### 1) Opening of the meeting

- a) The Chairman, John Biddulph, opened the meeting at 09:00 and invited the host organisation, the Swiss National NDT Board, to welcome the participants.

Mr. Jürgen Lindgens, a member of the Swiss Board, introduced Mr. Michael Sattler, the Accountable Manager of Jet Aviation (Basel), who welcomed those present to Basel and to the Swiss Air facilities. Jet Aviation, he said, supported the work of the Swiss Board and was pleased to play host to the present meeting. Unifying standards was considered by Jet Aviation to be an important area of work, and the Swiss NDT Board was influential in setting standards. Mr. Sattler wished a successful meeting and extended an invitation to tour the Swiss Air facility afterwards, time permitting.

- b) Those present introduced themselves, and the Secretary announced apologies for absence (attendance and apologies for absence are recorded at Annex A).

### 2) The Chairman updated the meeting on his vision for the strategic plan of the Forum, which was first presented at the 6<sup>th</sup> meeting.

### 3) The agenda and matters for discussion under 'Any Other Business' were confirmed.

### 4) Minutes of the previous meeting

- a) The minutes of the previous meeting were confirmed, and the Secretary was asked to upload them to the Forum webpage. **Action 2009/19: Secretary.**

- b) Matters arising from the minutes were confined to a review of the actions that had been assigned:

Reference	Action agreed	Assignment and timescale	Remarks
2009/01	Add R Henrich to ANDTBF/02 representing the German Board, and as Vice Chairman of the Forum until 22 June 2011	Secretary	Completed
2009/02	Establish that each of the Forum members is implementing ANDTBF/05 (Harmonisation of the Operations of the Members of the Forum).	All members	Carried forward
2009/03	Publish Chairman's 'Vision' presentation file on Forum web-page	Secretary	Carried forward
2009/04	Provide to Secretary a copy of the NADCAP audit checklist for onward transmission to EASA.	Chairman (2009-09-21)	Carried forward.
2009/05	Gather information concerning the nature of operations of each of the Boards (continuation of the survey initiated by the Portuguese Board)	Secretary	Carried forward
2009/06	New action plan item: Develop training syllabuses for aerospace NDT, including product technology. Members would be asked to participate, and a volunteer to convene a task group would be sought.	Secretary and members	Carried forward
2009/07	Action plan item: Elevate the profile of the Forum and its member boards through provision of information and short articles about the work of the Forum and its members.	Members	Action deleted
2009/08	Update and circulate revised action plan.	Secretary	Completed

Reference	Action agreed	Assignment and timescale	Remarks
2009/09	Discuss within EASA the fact that possession of EN 4179 was not sufficient for authority to certify a Form 1, the NDT operator also has to possess a national license. Mr Colin Langley agreed to take this up with the EASA person responsible and to communicate with Ms. Tajés who would provide an answer for circulation to members.	Colin Langley and Rosa Tages	Carried forward
2009/10	Interpretation of clause 4 of EASA AMC 145.A30(f) Personnel requirements “.....In the absence of a national aerospace NDT board, the NDT board of another Member State should be used, as defined by the competent authority.” Further discussion on this was deferred to the next meeting, by which time the results of a survey in answer to the question, and a discussion paper with responses would be circulated	Secretary	Carried forward
2009/11	A Swiss Board proposal for gaining experience simultaneously for certification in multiple NDT methods is to be referred by members to their national Boards, which were to be asked to respond, with or without comments or justification, on the acceptability of the proposal contained in the Swiss <a href="#">paper</a>	Members	Carried forward
2009/12	Swiss presentation, in <a href="#">flowchart</a> form, on qualification was noted for information, and was to be circulated with these minutes.	Secretary	2010-02-09 to JB & all
2009/13	A presentation by the Swiss Board related to <a href="#">alternative vision standards</a> is to be circulated to all members for information and comment	Secretary & Members	2010-02-09 to JB & all
2009/14	Request that EASA consider formal recognition of prEN 4179:2008 as an industry standard acceptable for implementation by ANDTB. The EASA position is that the prEN is not a standard and therefore cannot be recognised in the regulation.	Secretary & EASA Rulemaking	Completed
2009/15	Propose to the AIA-NAS project group that the NANDTB Forum be consulted in the interpretation consultation process.	Chairman	Completed.
2009/16	Upload Annual report (to 31 December 2008) to the Forum web-page.	Secretary	Carried forward
2009/17	Review and update <a href="#">ANDTBF/04</a> (PowerPoint presentation on the formation and work of the ANDTBF).	Secretary	Completed
2009/18	Members are requested to make contributions of general interest to the Secretary for upload to the <a href="#">ANDTBF web pages</a> in order that the site remained interesting and ‘live’.	Members	Deleted

## 5) Forum [Constitution](#) and [Membership](#)

- a) The meeting discussed and decided upon conditions for attendance by observers, who were defined by the meeting as:
  - i) Nominated representatives of a nation’s aerospace industry where that industry:
    - (1) was working towards the formation of a national NDT board, or
    - (2) had no plan to establish a national aerospace NDT board, but was using, or intending to use, the services of a board established by another nation’s aerospace industry.
- b) It was agreed to amend the Forum’s constitutional document to allow an ‘observer’ membership that conformed to the above This amended draft to be circulated for approval at the next meeting. **Action 2009/20: Secretary.**

## 6) [Action plan](#)

- a) The meeting reviewed progress and updated the action plan. **Action 2009/21: Secretary to circulate the revised plan.**

## 7) Status/Revision of applicable regulations and standards, and their interpretation

- a) It was confirmed that prEN 4179:2008 edition was adopted and implemented by most or all of the Forum Member Aerospace NDT Boards, regardless of the fact that EASA part 145 referred to the 2000 edition.

- b) The NAS 410 / prEN 4179:2008 interpretation process was reported by the chairman, who spoke of a meeting that he had had with ASD, during which it had been agreed that the Forum was the most appropriate body to respond to requests for interpretation from within the EU.
- c) There was some general discussion on the methodology adopted by AIA, whose interpretations were available only to AIA members. M. Auge requested a standstill on this until he had had an opportunity to consult with ASD-Stan, and he was given a two month period to do so. **Action 2009/22: M. Auge to consult (and report to the Secretary and Chairman on the consultation) with ASD-Stan by 8<sup>th</sup> February 2010.**
- 8) The meeting reviewed the status of ANDTBF documents, noting that none were due for review prior to the next meeting.
- 9) Relevant conferences and seminars were highlighted by members as follows:
- a) November 2010 in Hamburg – international NDT symposium
- b) 28/29 April 2010 in Bristol, UK, Aerospace Symposium
- 10) There being no other business, the date and location for the next meeting was agreed as:
- a) Moscow, Russia, Tuesday 8<sup>th</sup> June 2010 at 14:30 and, if not:
- b) London, UK, 15<sup>th</sup> June 2010 at 10:00. **Action 2009/23: Messrs. Biddulph and Thompson to research venue opportunities**

#### Annex A – attendance and apologies for absence

Representing	Representative(s) attending or offering apologies	Attending	Apologies
ANDTBF	THOMPSON John	1	0
Australia	HOCKINGS Colin	0	1
Austria	WOTTLE Roman	0	1
Belgium	TOMASOVIC Ante	0	1
Czech Republic	ZAVADIL Zbynek	0	1
Denmark	RASMUSSEN Henrik	1	0
EASA	TAJES Rosa	1	0
Finland	YLITALO Marko	0	1
France	BERNADI Joseph and AUGE Patrick	2	0
Germany	HENRICH Rudolf [apologies from Ralf Holstein]	1	1
Ireland	MURPHY, John	1	0
Italy	MERLETTI Luigi	0	1
Luxembourg	CRAB Danny	1	0
Malta	MUSCAT Albert	0	1
Netherlands	BUIJSEN Franc	0	1
Poland	BRONIEK Jacek	1	0
Portugal	FERREIRA Jose	0	1
Spain	GÓMEZ FRAILE Fermín and ARROYO PERFUMO Pedro	0	2
Sweden	GRYBÄCK Thomas	1	0
Switzerland	KLIEBER René, LINDGENS Jürgen and POLLIEN, John-Pierre	3	0
Turkey	SUNAOĞLU İker and TURKER Kivanc	2	0
UK	BIDDULPH Jon and PHILLIPS Keith	1	0
	Total	16	12

## Annex B – Actions assigned or outstanding

Reference	Action agreed	Assigned to	Remarks
2009/02	Establish that each of the Forum members is implementing ANDTBF/05 (Harmonisation of the Operations of the Members of the Forum). Members to positively inform the Secretary (using the record form at Annex A to ANDTBF/05 whether this is implemented in their country.	All members	On 2009-12-11 the Secretary emailed the members requesting confirmation of implementation of <a href="#">ANDTBF/05</a> . <b>As at 2010-06-14, only Australia, Poland and the UK had confirmed.</b>
2009/03	Publish Chairman's 'Vision' presentation file on Forum web-page	Secretary	Uploaded 2009-12-14
2009/04	Provide to Secretary a copy of the NADCAP audit checklist for onward transmission to EASA.	Chairman	Checklists emailed to Rosa T, cc Colin L and Karl S, 2010-01-26
2009/05	Gather information concerning the nature of operations of each of the Boards (continuation of the survey initiated by the Portuguese Board). Secretary to request completed survey report from Portuguese Board	Secretary	Survey request 2009-10-15. Repeated 2009-10-23. JRT requested final survey results from Portuguese Board on 2009-12-11. <b>No response as at 2010-05-04.</b>
2009/06	New action plan item: Develop training syllabus for aerospace ultrasonic NDT, including product technology, using CEN TC 25107 as basis for work. A Task Group comprising France, Germany (lead), Switzerland and the UK	Task Group	<a href="#">Action plan</a> updated 2009-12-07, and circulated to members 2009-12-11 with request to progress UT aerospace syllabus proposal. <b>As at 2010-05-04, no syllabus had been provided.</b>
2009/09	Discuss within EASA the fact that possession of EN 4179 was not sufficient for authority to certify a Form 1, the NDT operator also has to possess a national license. Mr Colin Langley agreed to take this up with the EASA person responsible and to communicate with Ms. Tajes who would provide an answer for circulation to members.	Colin Langley and Rosa Tages	Carried forward, with request for a flowchart showing what is required of the Level 3 individual providing outside agency services. <b>Agenda item.</b>
2009/10	Interpretation of clause 4 of EASA AMC 145.A30(f) Personnel requirements "..... <i>In the absence of a national aerospace NDT board, the NDT board of another Member State should be used, as defined by the competent authority.</i> " Secretary to chase members for further information.	Secretary	Some responses received; a <a href="#">new survey form</a> has been devised reflecting discussion at the 7 <sup>th</sup> Forum. <b>As at 2010-05-04, responses received from Australia, Poland and the UK only.</b>
2009/11	A Swiss Board proposal for gaining experience simultaneously for certification in multiple NDT methods is to be referred by members to their national Boards, which were to be asked to respond, with or without comments or justification, on the acceptability of the proposal contained in the Swiss <a href="#">paper</a>	Secretary (to chase) and members	On 2009-12-11 JRT requested members to indicate acceptance or rejection of the proposal, with or without comment. <b>Sec: See comments following this table.</b>
2009/12	The Swiss <a href="#">flowchart</a> on qualification was noted for information, and was to be reviewed by members, who would confirm that it showed their method of working, othe wise to provide an alternative proposal for the flowchart.	Members	<b>Sec: See comments following this table.</b>
2009/13	A presentation by the Swiss Board related to <a href="#">alternative vision standards</a> is to be updated and circulated to all members for information and comment. Report circulated 2009-08-24. Now to be further updated by the Swiss Board with reading distance figures and provided to the Secretary for circulation to members.	Swiss Board & Secretary	Circulated 2009-12-11. <b>Sec: See comments following this table.</b>
2009/16	2008 report to be uploaded to the Forum's webspace, and 2009 report to be completed following the Basel meeting for consideration at the next meeting.	Secretary	Uploaded 2008 report 2009-12-14. See 2009-12-14_ANDTBF Annual Report_2009
2009/19	The minutes of the previous meeting were confirmed, and the Secretary was asked to upload them to the Forum webspace.	Secretary	Uploaded 2009-12-14

Reference	Action agreed	Assigned to	Remarks
2009/20	amend the Forum's constitutional document to allow an 'observer' membership that conformed to the above This <a href="#">amended draft</a> issue 3 to be circulated for approval at the next meeting.	Secretary	Circulated with invitation to comment on 2009-12-09. <b>No response as at 2010-05-04; draft issue included in circulation of agenda.</b>
2009/21	The meeting reviewed progress and updated the action plan. , which is to be circulated to members for further action	Secretary and members	Circulated with draft minutes of the 7 <sup>th</sup> Forum on 2009-12-11
2009/22	M. Auge to consult (and report to the Secretary and Chairman on the consultation) with ASD-Stan by 8 <sup>th</sup> February 2010. <b>2010-06-14:</b> After agreement by ASD (Günter Lessmann), a WG regarding "Understanding of Standard EN4179/NAS410" has been created at European level (ASD). The ANDTBF should now discuss who will participate to this work and how to organize it. BNAE is ready to take secretary of this WG, and I (PA) can be the convener.	M. Auge	Response received 2010-06-14. PA wrote: This action can start this week if we agree who participate.
2009/23	Identify possible meeting venue in London for June 2010.	Chair and Sec	2010-01-26 JRT email to members and RSSNDT

### Action 2009/11

The Swiss Board proposal was reviewed by the **UK Board** and rejected as it allows an individual to be approved having gained less than the minimum 50% in all methods. The Australian Board offered comment by email on 15/12/009 that it could not support the proposal. The UK Board proposes the following:

Where experience is being gained simultaneously in two or more methods, the minimum experience may be reduced for each method as per table 1 providing the candidate is approved in or learning another NDT method(s), when agreed by the Level 3.

**TABLE 1 The minimum percentage sum of the experience required**

No. of methods	Percentage Required for Each Method						Reduction	
	First %	Second %	Third %	Fourth %	Fifth %	Sixth %	Proportional reduction	Percentage reduction
One	100						-	-
Two	100	50					150/200	25%
Three	100	50	50				200/300	33%
Four	100	50	50	50			250/400	38%
Five	100	50	50	50	50		300/500	40%
Six	100	50	50	50	50	50	350/600	42%

**Action 2009/12**

[The Swiss Board flowchart](#) was reviewed by the **UK Board** and does not reflect the UK method of working. Approval of NDT personnel rests solely with the employer, the UK Board only controls training and qualification. Acceptance of approvals held per different standards is the responsibility of the employer and as permitted in their written practice and compliant with EN4179. [The Australian Board provided a flowchart](#) detailing its process, which reflects the response of the UK Board.

**Action 2009/13**

The **UK Board** reviewed the Swiss Board alternative vision standards table and considers it to be incorrect. The UK Board would like to share a presentation at the next meeting setting out UK interim policy for vision requirements and to propose a new global vision standard for NDT personnel. Please add as an agenda item for the next meeting [Secretary's note: this would be a matter arising from the minutes. The Swiss Board has subsequently provided more information in two files – [JBSL-NDT-01](#) and [Eye Test calculations](#)].